

WEST AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

Tuesday 24 June 2014

COUNCILLORS PRESENT: Councillors Van Nooijen (Chair), Gotch (Vice-Chair), Benjamin, Clack, Cook, Price, Tanner and Lloyd-Shogbesan.

OFFICERS PRESENT: Murray Hancock (City Development), Michael Morgan (Law and Governance), Mathew Metcalfe (Democratic and Electoral Services), Felicity Byrne (City Development) and Matthew Parry (City Development)

1. ELECTION OF CHAIR FOR THE COUNCIL YEAR 2014/15

The Committee agreed to elect Councillor Oscar Van Nooijen as Chair for the Council Year 2014/15.

2. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIR FOR THE COUNCIL YEAR 2014/15

The Committee agreed to elect Councillor Michael Gotch as the Vice-Chair for the Council Year 2014/15.

3. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND SUBSTITUTIONS

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Anne-Marie Canning (substitute Councillor Ben Lloyd-Shogbesan) and Councillor Andrew Gant.

4. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest made.

5. 32 LITTLE CLARENDON STREET AND 126 AND 127 WALTON STREET - 14/00450/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for a change of use from Use Class A1 (Shops) to Use Class A3 (Restaurants and cafes).

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that *Christopher Coombe spoke against the application and no members of the public spoke in favour of it.

The Committee agreed that it would not have granted planning permission if it were able to do so, for the following reason:

The proposal would result in a reduction in the number of retail units within the Little Clarendon Street and Walton Street areas which would prejudice their viability and vitality as designated local shopping areas contrary to the requirements of policy RC6 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016.

6. 3-9 ELSFIELD WAY AND LAND AT REAR OF 478 AND 480 BANBURY ROAD- 14/00429/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the demolition of existing houses at 3 to 9 Elsfeld Way. Erection of 4x1 bed and 18x2 bed flats to frontage with 6x4 bed houses to rear. Provision of 40 car parking spaces, amenity space together with bin and cycle stores. New vehicular access and slips road from Elsfeld Way (A40). (Amended plans) (Amended description).

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that no one spoke against the application and no one spoke in favour of it.

The Committee agreed not to grant planning permission for the following reasons:

- (1) The development proposed would result in a significant intensification of a substandard vehicular access onto a high speed dual carriageway that would result in a substantial increase in difficult and dangerous manoeuvres into and out of the site to the detriment of the safety of users of the highway and the free flow of the highway network, contrary to the requirements of policy CP1 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016 as well as guidance set out in the National Planning Policy Framework.
- (2) The proposals would involve alterations to the public highway to include vehicular entry and exit slipways to the site. These alterations would adversely affect the future operation and deliverability of a fully committed and funded scheme by the Local Highway Authority to carry out major alterations to the Cutteslowe Roundabout to improve traffic flows and congestion on the A40. Consequently the proposals would have unacceptable impacts on wider traffic generation and vehicular movements through the city contrary to the requirements of policy CP1 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016 as well as guidance set out in the National Planning Policy Framework.
- (3) The development fails to provide on-site provision of affordable housing without robust justification for a number of assumptions, costs and land values included within the submitted viability appraisal justifying this approach, and as such the proposals fail to make the necessary contribution towards affordable housing in the City to the detriment of the mix and balance of the local community contrary to the requirements of policy HP3 of the Sites and Housing Plan 2011-2026 as well as policy CS24 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026 and guidance contained within the National Planning Policy Framework.
- (4) The development fails to provide an adequate mix of dwellings on the site to meet the identified future housing needs of the community of Oxford contrary to the requirements of policy CS23 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026 and guidance set out in the National Planning Policy Framework.
- (5) The proposed development represents a significant and unacceptable overdevelopment of the site which fails to respect the layout, density,

greenery and open space provision that characterises its suburban residential context. As a result the proposals fail to accord with the requirements of policies CP1, CP6, CP8, CP9, CP10 and CP11 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016, policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026 as well as policies HP9 and HP10 of the Sites and Housing Plan 2011-2026.

- (6) The outdoor amenity spaces proposed to serve the proposed dwellings are considered to be unacceptable in quality and quantity to the detriment of the quality of living of future occupiers of the dwellings contrary to the requirements of policy CP10 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016 as well as policies HP13 and HP14 of the Sites and Housing Plan 2011-2026.
- (7) Having regard to its close proximity to the road in combination with its significant overall mass, height and bulk, the building proposed at the front of the site would be obtrusively large and prominent within the streetscene and therefore out of character with its more spacious suburban setting evident in the relationship between the majority of existing surrounding buildings and the road frontage. As a consequence the development would fail to successfully integrate within its context which would be exacerbated by its highly prominent location, contrary to the requirements of policies CP1 and CP8 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016, policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy 2026 as well as policy HP9 of the Sites and Housing Plan 2011-2026.
- (8) The development involves the creation of a new access road outside a controlled parking zone. As a result of the lack of unallocated parking spaces to serve future residents and their visitors, the site would be likely to be subject to significant internal parking congestion adversely affecting vehicle manoeuvring within the site as well as the amenity enjoyed by future occupiers of the dwellings. Parking congestion within the site would also be likely to give rise to pressure for overspill parking. As a consequence the proposals fail to accord with the requirements of policy CP1 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016 as well as policy HP16 of the Sites and Housing Plan 2011-2026.
- (9) The development proposes the loss of a substantial number of existing trees on the site. The excessively close proximity of the proposed front building to the site frontage prevents meaningful compensatory soft landscaping and precludes the planting of trees without creating a poor spatial relationship with the south elevation of the building. As a result the development fails to adequately mitigate lost trees and soft landscape features on the site and does not provide an appropriate balance between the natural and built environment to the detriment of the character and appearance of the area and the streetscene, contrary to the requirements of policies CP1, CP11, NE15 and NE16 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016.
- (10) The development proposes dwellings within close proximity of the A40 with the result that future occupiers of the development would experience significant noise disturbance and, in the absence of any form of noise assessment, the local planning authority cannot conclude that the living conditions of future occupiers would be of an acceptable standard. Consequently the proposals fail to accord with the requirements of

policies CP1 and CP21 of the Oxford Local Plan 2001-2016 in this respect.

7. COVERED MARKET, HIGH STREET, OXFORD - 14/01212/CT3 AND 14/011213/CT3

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning applications as follows:

Application 14/01212/CT3 – Removal of flat roofs and erection of roofs with roof lights. Replacement of plastic cladding with grilles, new pentice roof at Avenue 2 and other works.

Application 14/01213/CT3 – Listed Building Consent for removal of flat roofs and erection of roofs with roof lights. Replacement of plastic cladding with grilles, new pentice roof at Avenue 2 and other works.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that no one spoke against the application and no one spoke in favour of it.

The Committee agreed:

(a) With regard to application 14/01212/CT3 to grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Development begun within time limit
- (2) Develop in accordance with approve plans
- (3) Samples in Conservation Area
- (4) Archaeology: Implementation of programme

(b) With regard to application 14/01213/CT3 to raise no objection to the granting of listed building consent by the Government Office subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Commencement of works LB/CAC consent
- (2) LB consent – works as approved only
- (3) 7 days' notice LPA
- (4) LB notice of completion
- (5) Further works – fabric of LB – fir regulations
- (6) Repair of damage after works
- (7) Materials - samples

8. PUBLIC CONVENIENCES - SPEEDWELL STREET, OXFORD - 14/00763/CT3

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the erection of a single storey front extension and insertion of timber doors to side elevation.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that no one spoke against the application and no one spoke in favour of it.

The Committee agreed to raise no objection to the granting of planning permission subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Development begun within time limit
- (2) Develop in accordance with approved plans
- (3) Materials as approved, brickwork to match the existing, metal sheet faced timber doors painted Oxford Blue, BDC3965/07

9. ST. ANDREW'S CHURCH, LINTON ROAD, OXFORD - 14/00953/VAR

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the variation of condition 2 (Develop in accordance with approved plans) of planning permission 13/02966/VAR (Variation of condition 2 (Develop in accordance with approved plans) of existing permission 12/00565/FUL (Proposed single and two storey side extension) to allow an increase in the size of a kitchen and insertion of two louvres to form basement. (Retrospective).

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that Simon Beaumont, Charles Darby and Alistair Booth spoke in favour of the application.

The Committee agreed to grant planning application subject to the following conditions

- 1 Development begun within time limit
- 2 In accordance with approved plans
- 3 Materials
- 4 Landscape plan required
- 5 Landscape carry out after completion
- 6 Landscape underground services - tree roots
- 7 Tree Protection Plan (TPP) 1
- 8 Construction Travel Plan
- 9 SUDS
- 10 Glazing on southern elevation
- 11 Cycle Parking facilities
- 12 Details of buggy store
- 13 Sustainability design/construction
- 14 Boundary details before commencement
- 15 Details photovoltaics
- 16 Architectural recording
- 17 Mortar
- 18 Stability of heritage fabric
- 19 Details of bin store
- 20 Details of cooking scheme etc.
- 21 Noise restriction

10. 46 HYTHE BRIDGE STREET - 14/00651/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the conversion of existing building to form 6x1 bedroom flats (Use Class C3).

The Committee noted that this application had been withdrawn and was not considered at the meeting.

11. 40 MARSTON STREET, OXFORD - 14/01054/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the erection of a part single, part two storey rear extension.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that Marc Chenery spoke in favour of the application.

The Committee agreed grant planning application subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Development begun within time limit
- (2) Develop in accordance with approved plans
- (3) Materials matching

12. 5 CANNING CRESCENT - 14/00209/FUL AND 14/00215/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed two planning applications as follows:

Application – 14/00209/FUL - Erection of a two storey extension to the rear elevations Ref: PD2

Application – 14/00215/FUL – Two storey extension to rear and side elevations Ref: PD3

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that Toby Smith and Manuel Berdoy spoke in favour of the application.

The Committee agreed:

To support planning applications 14/00209/FUL and 14/00215/FUL subject to and including the following conditions and informatives for both applications, and to delegate to officer the issuing of the notices of planning permission on receipt of no further comments being received from Members of the Committee:

Conditions

- (1) Development begun within time limit
- (2) Develop in accordance with approved plans
- (3) Materials to match
- (4) Removal of PD rights
- (5) No additional windows in side elevations
- (6) Flood Risk Assessment

Informatives

- (1) Sewerage and drainage

13. 9 FYFIELD ROAD - 14/00910/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the erection of single storey extension to rear elevation, with basement below and 2 no. lightwells. Erection of four storey extension to side elevation including insertion of new dormer window to side roof slope and 1 no. velux window. Provision of new cast iron railing to site frontage.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that Richard Martin and Jac Cross spoke against the application and Chris West and Kieron Roberts spoke in favour of it.

The Committee agreed to grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Development begun within time limit
- (2) Develop in accordance with approved plans
- (3) Sample Panel
- (4) Obscure glass
- (5) Railings – Further details
- (6) Tree Protection Plan (TPP)²
- (7) Landscaping
- (8) Arch – Implementation of programme prehistoric remains

14. 66 CARDIGAN STREET, OXFORD - 14/00961/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the erection of a part single, part two storey rear extension.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that no one spoke against the application and no one spoke in favour of it.

The Committee agreed to grant planning permission subject to the following conditions:

- 1 Development begun within time limit
- 2 Develop in accordance with approved plans
- 3 Materials as specified
- 4 Ground resurfacing - SUDS compliant
- 5 Flooding: floor levels

15. 48 PLANTATION ROAD, OXFORD - 14/01235/FUL

The Head of City Development submitted a report (previously circulated now appended) which detailed a planning application for the demolition of existing garage. Erection of part-single, part-two storey extension to side elevation and two storey extension to rear elevation. Extension to existing basement.

In accordance with the criteria for public speaking, the Committee noted that Mary Pegler and Philippa Scoones spoke against the application and Andrew Hudson and Pippa Hoyler-Millar spoke in favour of it.

The Committee agreed not to grant planning permission for the following reasons:

- (1) The form, scale and appearance of the proposed development would neither preserve nor enhance the character nor appearance of the Walton Manor Conservations Area in which it is located contrary to policies CP1, CP8, CP9, CP10 and HE7 of the Oxford Local Plan, policy CS18 of the Oxford Core Strategy and policies HP9 and HP14 of the Oxford Sites and Housing Plan.

16. PLANNING APPEALS

The Head of City Development submitted two reports detailing the planning appeals received and determined during April and May 2014.

The Committee agreed to note the reports on planning appeals received and determined during April and May 2014.

17. MINUTES

The Committee agreed to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 7th May 2014.

18. FORTHCOMING APPLICATIONS

The Committee agreed to note the list of forthcoming applications.

- 16 Crick Road, Oxford – 14/00962/FUL – Extensions
- Elsfeld Way, Oxford – 13/03454/CT3 – Residential
- Former Builders Yard, Collins Street, Oxford – 14/01273/OUT – Employment and residential
- Former Filling Station, Abingdon Road, Oxford – 13/02638/FUL – Residential
- Former Paper Mill, Mill Street, Wolvercote, Oxford – 13/01861/OUT – Residential
- Becket Street – 14/01160/FUL – Temporary car park
- 125 Harefields – 14/01255/CEU – Lawful Development Certificate
- 12-15 Bath Street – 14/01272/FUL - Extensions

19. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The Committee noted its meetings for the 2014/15 Council Year.

2014

Tuesday 22nd July (Wednesday 23rd July if necessary)
Tuesday 12th August (Thursday 14th August if necessary)
Tuesday 9th September (Thursday 11th September if necessary)
Wednesday 8th October (Thursday 9th October if necessary)
Wednesday 12th November (Thursday 13th November if necessary)
Wednesday 10th December (Thursday 11th December if necessary)

2015

Tuesday 13th January (Thursday 15th January if necessary)
Tuesday 10th February (Thursday 12th February if necessary)
Tuesday 10th March (Thursday 19th March if necessary)
Tuesday 14th April (Thursday 16th April if necessary)
Tuesday 12th May (Thursday 14th May if necessary)

The meeting started at 6.30 pm and ended at 8.51 pm